## Perspectives on Low Impact Development (LID) Innovations at Multiple Scales: Oklahoma and Beyond

#### Jason R. Vogel, Ph.D., P.E.

Director, Oklahoma Water Survey Associate Professor, Civil Engineering & Environmental Science University of Oklahoma

# OKLAHOMA WATER SURVEY

#### Reid Coffman, Ph.D.

Director, Novel Ecology Design Lab Associate Professor, Architecture & Environmental Design Kent State University



"...covering a ground plot with buildings and pavements, which carry off most of the rain and prevent its soaking into the Earth and renewing and purifying the springs ... the water of wells must gradually grow worse, and in time be unfit for use as I find has happened in all old cities."

#### Benjamin Franklin, 1789



Painting by Michael J Deas





#### LID – An Engineer's Perspective



#### LID – A Landscape Architect's Perspective

- Water creates place.
- Enables the co-benefits of water in urban ecosystems services.
- Framework of innovation. Corner, 1997



### LID Continuum of Contributors



#### LID Innovations – Oklahoma and Beyond







#### LID Innovations: the Individual Practice Scale







# **First Flush Diverter Sizing**





**Objective:** Investigate sizing of first flush diverters for rainwater harvesting.

- Background:
  - Majority of a rooftop's dust and debris is believed to be washed away during the "first flush"
  - Yaziz et al. (1989): 1.3 gallons/194 ft<sup>2</sup> galvanizediron and concrete tile roofs
  - Martinson and Thomas (2005): Each mm of diverted rainwater halves contamination
  - Texas Manual on Rainwater Harvesting (2005): 1 – 2 gallons/100ft<sup>2</sup> of catchment area

Yet to be a universal consensus on what exactly constitutes a first flush











## **First Flush Diverter Sizing**



#### TWDB Recommend 0.41 – 0.82 mm diversion



Percent mass Removals	Asphalt Shingle (n = 93) Diversions (mm)	Diversions (mm)	Diversions (mm)	Diversions (mm)
TSS	92% CL	95% CL	93% CL	83% CL
50%	3.0	4.6	1.0	1.1
75%	7.3	6.6	4.8	1.6
90%	10	12	8.3	2.1
95%	12	13	10	2.4
Commonly Detected PAHs	90% CL	94% CL	90% CL	83% CL
50%	2.3	0.95	0.67	0.52
75%	6.1	2.4	1.0	0.89
90%	12	6.6	1.2	1.2
95%	15	8.8	1.9	1.3
Carcinogenic PAHs	90% CL	94% CL	90% CL	83% CL
50%	2.4	0.92	0.63	0.52
75%	5.9	1.5	0.95	0.88
90%	8.0	2.3	1.1	1.2
95%	8.7	2.7	1.2	1.3
Fluoranthene	90% CL	93% CL ***	90% CL	67% CL *
50%	4.7	1.0	0.71	0.20
75%	12	1.6	1.1	0.30
90%	16	6.0	1.7	0.36
95%	18	6.3	2.0	0.38
Benzo(a)pyrene	90% CL	94% CL	0.43% CL <sup>a</sup>	74% CL **
50%	2.7	0.78	0.60	0.42
75%	5.6	1.4	0.90	0.60
90%	8.1	2.0	1.1	0.72
95%	8.7	2.2	1.1	0.76

Upper Confidence Limits based on  $\alpha$  = 0.2

\*n = 5; \*\*n = 6; \*\*\*n = 27; \*All samples had same diversions for respective mass removal rate





### Fly Ash for Enhanced Phosphorus Removal in Bioretention Cells

- Find an inexpensive filter media with high P sorption.
  - Lab screening
  - 1-D modeling
- Construct the Grove BRC
  - Standardize design and document construction
  - Quantify filter media during construction
- Perform detailed 3-D modeling of "As-Built"
- Sample filter media and water to evaluate BRC performance after operating for seven years.





Sividual



### **Estimation of Load Reduction**

Regressions on the measured influent and effluent concentrations and flow, as a function precipitation, were used to estimate the total mass removal for 2015, using the full year rainfall.

Cell	Nitrogen (lb/yr)	P (lb/yr)	Sediment (ton/yr)
Elm Creek Plaza	2.02	0.38	0.15
Grove High School	0.80	0.32	0.38



#### Elm Creek Plaza BRC

**Sividual** 

#### Other work on these cells includes

- Construction costs
- Construction standards
- Maintenance issues
- Planting
- Plant survival

- Initial water quality
- Initial hydraulics
- Current hydraulics
- Heavy metal removal
- Bacteria removal



#### **Next Steps**

- Investigating aggregated fly ash as an underdrain insert for P and heavy metal removal
- Exploring other additives

### Constructed Wetlands for Treating Nursery Runoff

Cedar Valley Nursery Ada, OK



Precure

cedar ... valley





dividual

#### **Constructed Wetlands for Treating Nursery Runoff**











öwidual,



# Non-pesticide Analytes in a Subsurface-flow Constructed Wetland



\* – Statistically significant with 95% confidence





Precure.

cedar ... vallev

# **Pesticide Mass Reduction**

#### (compounds present for >50% of events)

Compounds	<b>P-value</b>	<b>Paired Samples</b>	<b>Mass Reduction</b>
Chlorothalonil	0.009*	9	92%
Bifenthrin	0.004*	11	92%
Chlorpyrifos	0.036*	6	99%
Dimethanamid	0.009*	9	97%
Indaziflam	0.035*	7	86%
Isoxaben	0.021*	8	88%
Myclobutanil	0.004*	11	92%
Oxadiazon	0.004*	11	89%
Oxyfluorfen	0.295	6	74%
Pendimethalin	0.006*	10	79%
Propiconazole	0.004*	11	88%
			JUNTED STATES LICDA

Precure

cedar, Vallev

Sividual Pro-



### **Modeling Structured Gravel Parking**





**Objective:** Determine the appropriate initial abstraction (Ia) and curve number (CN) to use for designing structured gravel parking lots.

**Hypothesis:** The initial abstraction will be a function of the depth and porosity of the gravel, and the curve number will match that of the underlying soil





### **Curve Number Calculations**

$$Q = \frac{(P - I_a)^2}{P - I_a + S} \qquad Q = \frac{(P - 0.2S)^2}{P + 0.8S}$$
$$I_a = 0.2S \qquad CN = \frac{1000}{10 + S}$$

Q = Runoff Depth (inches) P = Rainfall Depth (inches) S = Potential Maximum Retention  $I_a$  = Initial Abstraction CN = Curve Number Relationship between Initial Abstraction (Ia) and Potential Maximum Retention (S)





## **Modeling Structured Gravel Parking**

Issue: Is 0.2S the appropriate estimation for the Ia for gravel parking lots, when it was actually developed for soil?

$$Q = \frac{(P - 0.2S)^2}{P + 0.8S}$$







öwidual,

#### Long-term Clogging and Deep Cleaning of Pervious Concrete







## Long-term Clogging

Strongly
 Correlated to
 bulk density
 when installed





### Deep Cleaning

1. Dry vacuum



#### 2. Wet vacuum



3 & 4. Vacuum sweeper (wet and dry)



5. Pressure wash and vacuum combination









% particles collected in wet condition

% particles collected in dry condition





#### **Leaching from Compost Filter Socks**





**Objective:** Determine the leaching potential of compost filter socks based on the contaminant concentration of incoming runoff.

Hypothesis: Leaching of contaminants(specifically P) will be correlated to influentP and sediment.



P Leaching = Influent P & Influent Sediment



# Methods

- Amended ASTM method for testing silt fences
- Testing a factorial design of sediment and nutrients
- Completed testing on socks from Minnick Materials/Fertile Ground
- Plan to test from City of Midwest City.







### **Preliminary Results**

- Outflow ortho-P =
  0.279 + 0.812(Inflow P)
   0.018(Inflow sed)
  - All p-values <0.01
  - R-squared = 0.96
  - All values are mg/L







dividual ,

# **Floating Wetland Breakwaters**

Objective: Design, test, install, and monitor a Floating Wetland Breakwater optimized for wave reduction to reduce shoreline erosion





Sividual







# Green roof

#### Reid Coffman MLA PhD

Assistant Professor of Landscape Architecture, University of Oklahoma

#### Petra Klein, PhD

Associate Professor of Meteorology, University of Oklahoma

#### Lee Fithian, LEED AP

Assistant Professor of Architecture, University of Oklahoma

#### Jason Vogel, PhD

Assistant Professor of Biosystems and Agricultural Engineering, Oklahoma State University









Fig. 1. Photos of (a) installation, (b) initial setup in May 2010, and (c) plant coverage in Spring 2012.



Klein, P., and Coffman, R., 2015. Establishment and Performance of an Experimental Green Roof under Extreme Climatic Conditions. *Science of the Total Environment* Volumes 512–513, 15 April, Pages 82-93,

#### Material Coverage of the Roof





Fig. 5. Surface coverage of materials showing a decreasing area of bare soils and increasing native grass cover during the initial 26 month establishment period.

Klein, P., and Coffman, R., 2015. Establishment and Performance of an Experimental Green Roof under Extreme Climatic Conditions. *Science of the Total Environment* Volumes 512–513, 15 April, Pages 82-93,





#### P.M. Klein, R. Coffman / Science of the Total Environment 512-513 (2015) 82-93







HOME / NEWS / ABOUT / STUDY OPPORTUNTIES / PUBLICATIONS / CONTACT



www.NEDlab.org

Windual Practices









KENT STATE.

udigitalhumanities.org

Materials 2016, 9, 611

## **Beneficial Dredge Re-Use**



STATE.

Beneficial Use of River Dredge



25-Jun-15 019467 WD14.3mm 15.0kV x2.5k 20um

(c) S2\_5%\_1100
### **Greater Hydrologic Retention**



sudigitalhumanities.or

37

### **Growing Rare Plants**



KENT STATE.

sudigitalhumanities.or

### Moos Lake Water Plant 1914 Zurich, Switzerland



### **Co-Benefit Biodiversity Roofs**

- 5 year agreement
- Design speculative habitat roofs and other forms of living architecture based on bedrock remnant prairies in NE Ohio.

**Living Architecture** 



40

udigitalhumanities.or

R.Coffman

### The Future of LID Innovation on Individual Practices

#### **Engineering**

- Amendments
- Investigating the role of plants
- Greenroof plants for Oklahoma
- Designing for maintenance
- Optimizing underdrain design for water quality
- Optimizing co-benefits

#### Landscape Architecture

- Ecologically productive buildings
- Regionally distinctive site practices
- Plant selection/performance



owidual P



### LID Innovations: the Neighborhood Scale







# Deerfield Estates Neighborhood Retrofit



dividual

# 'Forest Brook' Concept

- Neighborhood Suidual Practices
- This concept provides the personal feature of a stone stream channel meandering within a forested garden setting.
- 360 ft<sup>2</sup> rain garden with no underdrain in residential back yard with dry creek bed channel to reduce erosion on higher slope; Cost = \$8K





### 'Forest Brook' After Construction



dividua,



# 'Forest Brook' the next year





# **Biofiltration Vane**

#### Bioretention



Grass swale



Cross vane



ind;

Retention, infiltration, and treatment Handle higher flow velocities

## Natural grade control structure



#### **Biofiltration vane**

- Retention/infiltration
- Treatment
- Stormwater drainage



### **Biofiltration Vane**

Sinidual





### **Biofiltration Vane**





# 'Green Swing' concept







# 'Green Swing' construction

dividual Stridual

• Golf green look and function



# 'Green Swing' a year later

- Reduction of:
  - Bacteria
  - Phosphorus
  - Sediment



#### TRAILWOODS Greenstreet

Neighborhood Bioretention Project

# Multiple Benefits



Siniduar







ces







Lawn Rain Gardens Mean Difference Std Error Upper 95% Lower 95% -0.1674 Ν Correlation

0.38 t-Ratio -3.37293 0.485 DF -0.105 Prob > |t| 0.03113 Prob > t -0.0426 Prob < t

56 -0.1653





Higher ecological and biological processing that conventional tree lawns (NDVI) 

The rain gardens possessed a higher mean NDVI (0.48) when compared to the lawn (0.38), t(55) = 3.38, p < .001) using JMP software

#### Plant Palette

#### Prairie



Stonecrop Sedum Sedum acre 'Arabicus'



Dwarf Fountain Grass Pennisetum alopecuroides



Dwarf Japanese Juniper Juniperus procumbens 'Nana'



Wormwood Autumn Artemisia 'Powis Castle' Sage Salvia greggii



**Desert Willow** Chilopsis linearis







Mexican Primrose Oenothera macrocarpa



**Daylily** Hemerocallis 'Aztec Gold'



'Broadmore'



Pine

Pinus taeda



Common Redbud Cercis canadensis







Verbena canadensis 'Homestead Purple'

Coneflower Liriope Echinacea purpurea Liriope muscari 'Big Blue'

Betula nigra

Ulmus crassifolia



London Planetree Plantanus x hisanica





# The Future of LID Innovation at the Neighborhood Scale

### Engineering

- Integrated modeling
- Treatment Trains
- Big Data

#### Landscape Architecture

- Public Space
- Identity and Purpose
- Aesthetics of Place





divid

### LID Innovations: the Municipality/Regional Scale







### **Cleveland Metroparks Watershed Stewardship Center Roof**



### Germany – co-benefits for stormwater and energy





T STATE.

пи I A R!Coffman

Extensive Vegetation (Sedums, etc.) Growing Media Filter Fabric Moisture Retention / Drainage Panel Insulation Root Barrier Protection Course Waterproofing Membrane (hot rubberized Substrate (concrete deck depicted)





### **Cleveland Metroparks Watershed Stewardship Center Roof**







### **Phosphorus Leaving the Roof**



Sugano, Jefferson, Kinsman-Costello and Avellaneda, *Evaluation of Bioretention Cell and Green Roof Performance in Parma, Ohio.* Ohio Stormwater Conference. May 2017



osmoco

**R**.Coffman

### **Team Tool**

#### Advisory Board

#### 2015-2017: Quarterly mtgs.

1.Keely Davidson-Bennett Chagrin River Watershed 2.Elizabeth Hieser Cuyahoga County Soil and Water 3.Rachel Webb NEORSD 4. Jay Dorsey ODNR 5. Dan Bogoevski OEPA 6.Katherine Holmok Environmental Design Group 7. Rick Espe MKSK 8. Paul Novak US EPA 9. Jonathan Moody US EPA 10.Mark McCabe Graham, Smith and Partners 11. Aaron Jennings Case Western 12.Kelly Turner *Kent State University* 13. Laura Johnson Heidelburg University NCWQR 14. Chris Cheraso Cleveland Metroparks



















#### Forest








## **Project Signature**

Equity

Order

4

# Evapotranspiration Vegetative Cover Native speci Climate Wellow

Nutrient Retention

## Hydrology Domain

**Storage** Site and rainfall water storage. Water capture for use by plants, people or animals.

Others terms: event based capture and discharge (i.e. 2 yr storm event), water recycle and reuse.

#### Infiltration

Water moving into the soil saturating the surface soil for plants and other organisms and groundwater recharge.

Others terms: soil saturation, baseflow, interflow, aquifer recharge

## **Evapotranspiration** "Drying-out" of land, moving liquid water to atmospheric

gas state

Other terms: atmospheric moisture, humidifying



#### **Project Signature**

## Human Domain



#### Equity

Accessibility, assembly, social inclusion, and participation with the infrastructure/site

Others terms: democracy, fellowship, inclusion, participation, knowledge, education

#### Wellness

The positive effects on physiological and psychological improvement to humans.

Others terms: Recreation, activity, stress reduction, restoration therapy, concentration,

## **Order**

A legible landscape for practical purposes and human meaning.

Other terms: legibility, functionalism, visual quality, formal aesthetics



## Nutrient and Energy Domain



#### Climate

Working against the urban heat island to create comfortable environments and conditions habitable by all species.

Others terms: air temperature, urban cooling, solar interception, surface temperature, flux

#### Green House Gases Regulation of

carbon dioxide, methane and harmful atmospheric gases

Common examples include: carbon, methane,

#### **Nutrient Retention**

To regulate the nutrients in the terrestrial water supply.

Others terms: phosphorus reduction, nitrate reduction, trace element management: Fe, PB, TSS, OM, Etc.



#### **Project Signature**

## **Biodiversity Domain**



## Vegetative Cover The area of trees, shrubs, grasses, legumes,

forbs, and mosses.

Others terms: biomass, canopy cover, harvest

#### **Biodiversity**

The variety of life forms including the full range of plant, animal and other species present in an area.

Others terms: species diversity, ecosystem diversity, functional diversity, refuge/nursery

## Native Species Use and protection of native plant species to an

area.

Others terms: nativity, local species, regional



## **Project Signature**





## **City of Tulsa Design Criteria Manual**

- For implementation of LID at a widespread scale, practitioners need defined goals to design to.
- Select a design goal, known as the stormwater volume (SWV).
- Specific design goals for each practice.
- Will be use for an incentive program to be designed in the future.
- Maintenance and inspection procedures and specifications are next on the list.







## **Stormwater Volume Determination**





- Percentile Storms for Tulsa
  - 90<sup>th</sup> Percentile: 1.48 in
  - 85<sup>th</sup> Percentile: 1.15 in
  - 80<sup>th</sup> Percentile: 0.98 in

Source: Bixby Mesonet Station

- We chose 1.0 inches of runoff from impervious surfaces as a design goal for the SWV.
  - Approximately 85% storm
  - 50% of total rain captured



## **Design Criteria Manual Innovations**



- Bioretention and Pervious Pavement:
  - Allow for credit for infiltrated volume over the first four (4) hours of the storm
  - Very specific underdrain requirements
- Pervious Pavement: Overdrain required if no underdrain
- Rainwater Harvesting:
  - Orifice outlet to drain stormwater volume over 48 hours
- Downspout Disconnection:
  - Use field data to validate partial credit for downspout disconnection under specific circumstances
- Greenroofs:
  - Blanket 60% credit because volume reduction is not correlated to thickness or other parameters



## Optimization LID Using the EPA Stormwater Calculator and Excel Solver



# Regression

• EPA Stormwater Calculator output for different percentages of impervious area treated by each singular LID type





# **Regression (cont.)**

20

**Runoff Depth for Impervious Area Treated by Different LID Types** 



40

**Percent of Impervious Area Treated** 

- Disconnection
- Green Roof
- Infiltration Basin
- Rain Gardens(5%)
- Rain Harvest
- Street Planter
- Rain Gardens(10%)
- 100 Permeable Pavement



Ο

# **Minimization Function**









# **Regional Demonstrations**









# The Future of LID Innovation at the Municipality/Regional Scale

## Engineering

- Watershed-based implementation and modeling
- Integration with TMDL's
- Design optimization for more parameters
- Big data
- Regional demonstrations

#### Landscape Architecture

Indi

- Park systems
- Resilience Planning
- Co-Benefits/Trade-offs
- Public Investment





## LID Innovations: the Big Picture







# World Green Roof Market





**N M I A F B Z I L Å** http://meetingoftheminds.org/building-integrated-vegetation-mitigatingurban-environmental-challenges-with-building-material-technologies-82:

#### Green Roof Market Growth



#### In 2016, 4,061,024 s.f. of green roofing installed.

(respondents recorded 889 projects in 40 US states and six Canadian provinces)

# 10.3% growth rate over 2015

#### Green Roofs for Healthy Cities (GRHC) is a non-profit

industry association working to promote the green roof and wall industry throughout North America.

#### <u>Mission</u>

GRHC's mission is to **develop and protect the market** by increasing the awareness of the economic, social, and environmental benefits of green roofs, green walls, and other forms **of living architecture** through education, advocacy, professional development and celebrations of excellence.

#### <u>Services</u>

Annual Conferences

- CitiesAlive National Conference
- Grey to Green Regional Conference

Local Advocacy Efforts

• Symposia

**Resource Generation** 

• Market Survey

Publications

- Journal of Living Architecture (JLIV)
- Living Architecture Monitor









#### Journal

SEARCH ARTICLES FROM THE JOURNAL OF LIVING ARCHITECTURE

#### RESEARCH

ARTICLES SUBMIT ABOUT

Q. Search		
	SEE ALL JLIV ARTICLES	



**Living Architecture** 

#### LANDSCAPE PERFORMANCE SERIES<sup>by the</sup> Landscape Architecture Foundation

**Case Study Briefs** 

**Fast Fact Library** 

#### **Benefits Toolkit**

#### Collections

Browse and Search hundreds of Landscape Performance Series Resources > About Landscape Performance Blog Training Guide to Evaluate Performance Resources for Educators Contact

Q

The Landscape Performance Series is the online set of resources to help designers, agencies, and advocates evaluate performance, show value and make the case for sustainable landscape solutions.



Active Living >

Resilience >

**Biodiversity** >



#### Gary Comer Youth...

Revitalization >

Social Equity >

Water Management >

#### landscapeperformance.org



# **Creating Learning Communities**

# www.greatplainslid.org

DESIGN COMPETITION

CONTACT PAGE

**GREAT PLAINS** 

LID

Home / Water Environment Research, Volume 87, Number 9



Critical Review of Technical Questions Facing Low Impact Development and Green Infrastructure: A Perspective from the Great Plains





Authors: Vogel, Jason R.; Moore, Trisha L.; Coffman, Reid R.; Rodie, Steven N.; Hutchinson, Stacy L.; McDonough, Kelsey R.; McLemore, Alex J.; McMaine, John T. Source: Water Environment Research, Volume 87, Number 9, September 2015, pp. 849-862(14) Publisher: Water Environment Federation DOI: https://doi.org/10.2175/106143015X14362865226392



# National Green Infrastructure Certification Program





Welcome to NGICP, the standard for national certification of green infrastructure (GI)

construction, inspection, and maintenance workers.





See a list of certified individuals

# The Future of LID Innovation: the Big Picture

## Engineering

- Create regional/national interdisciplinary communities and platforms
- Design and Maintenance Training/Certification
- Integration of Disciplines

#### Landscape Architecture

- Policy for Green roofs
- Landscape Performance
- Systems Thinking
- Bundling Ecosystem Services





## **Concluding Remarks**

- •Optimizing co-benefits at all scales
- Provides platform for creativity
- Interdisciplinary is the way to go
- •We must work together for solutions





# Thanks to our students, partners, and funding agencies who make this work possible.



#### Low Impact Development Innovations – Oklahoma and Beyond



#### **Jason Vogel**

Individual Practices	Neighborhood		
Rainwater Harvesting First Flush Fly Ash Bioretention Pesticides Constructed Wetlands Pervious Concrete Clogging Compost Filter Socks Floating Wetland Wavebreaks	Deerfield Estates Bioretention EPA Stormwater Calculator Optimization		
<b>Municipality/Region</b>	The Big Picture		
COT Design Criteria COT Maintenance and Inspection	Great Plains LID Symposium & Competition Oklahoma Demonstrations/Education NGICP <i>Water Environment Research</i> Lit Reviews		
Reid Coffman			
	NL-1-1-1-1-1		

Individual Practices	Neighborhood
NWC Green Roof	Trailwoods Development
Municipality/Region	The Big Picture
Oklahoma Bioretention Plants OKC Green Roof Symposium	Ecosystem Services Journal of Living Architecture